

Comments from: Planning Policy

Date: 2 November 2020

Application: 2/2018/1124/OUT

Proposal: Develop land by the erection of 72 No. dwellings and new community facilities (Outline)

Address: Land north of Crown Road, Marnhull

Applicant: Cicero Estates

Introduction

Planning Policy originally made comments on this application in February 2019. The following is intended to provide an update with regards to the latest monitoring data in order to assist the decision maker.

North Dorset Residential Monitoring

The most recent North Dorset Authority Monitoring Report (published January 2020) sets out that at April 2019 the former district's deliverable housing land supply (DHLS) is 4.0 years. This position was first put forward by Dorset Council in an appeal hearing for a residential scheme at Churchfoot Lane, Hazelbury Bryan (ref 2/2018/0462/OUT).

Net Dwelling Completions in Marnhull, 2011–2020

2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	Total
1	3	6	1	2	1	9	15	9	47

Residential consents in Marnhull, 1st April 2020

App ref	Address	Net dwellings
2/2012/0771/PLNG	Longonot, Crown Road	1
2/2015/0522/REM	Land Adjacent Joyces, New Street	2
2/2015/1382/FUL	Land At St (e) 378920 (n) 119092 Salisbury Street	1
2/2016/0518/FUL	Strangways Farm, Hains Lane	3
2/2017/0353/OUT	Greenfields, Sodom Lane	3
2/2017/0994/FUL	Land At E 378884 N 119145, Corner Close	1
2/2017/1926/FUL	Popes Farm, New Street To Common Lane	1
2/2018/0441/AGDWPA	Agricultural Building, Haines Lane To Ham Lane	1
2/2018/1436/OUT	Land North Of Kentisworth Road	9
2/2018/1589/FUL	8A Burton Street	1
2/2018/1768/FUL	Os Plot 7987, Stoneylawn	1
2/2018/1391/OUT	Land Adjacent Joyces, New Street	7
2/2018/1303/OUT	Land North Of Elmside, Musbury Lane	1
2/2019/0722/FUL	Barn At Ashley Down Farm, Great Down Lane	1
2/2019/0904/REM	Vale Cottage, Ham Lane	2
2/2019/0623/FUL	Land At E 377595 N 118361, Goddards	1
Total		36

The Census in 2011 recorded the number of dwellings in Marnhull to be 962. Therefore, our evidence suggests that the number of dwellings in the village has or would cumulatively rise as follows:

Source	Net dwellings	Cumulative increase (%)	NPPF 'deliverable'
Completions 2011–2020	47	5%	Y
Full and minor consents, April 2020	36	9%	Y
Land north Of Burton Street	61	15%	N
Land north of Crown Road (this application)	72	22%	N
Land north of Chippel Lane	58	28%	N

The schemes at Burton Street, Crown Road, and Chippell Lane are outline applications for major development. They therefore can only be considered *deliverable* (according to the NPPF definition) “where there is clear evidence that housing completions will begin on site within five years.”

Calculating an appropriate increase in housing stock for Marnhull

With a dwelling stock size of 962 at the time of the 2011 Census, Marnhull is the second largest second tier settlement in North Dorset. Since 2011 (the start of the plan period) it has grown by 5% (47 dwellings). By contrast, during the same period the overall growth of the second tier settlements has been 3.9%.

Policy 6 of Local Plan Part 1 sets out that at least 825 new dwellings are to be built in the countryside, including Stalbridge and the villages, during the plan period 2011–2031 to contribute towards meeting identified local and essential rural housing needs. The Local Plan does not set out how the 825 dwellings should be distributed. Recently a number of local communities have calculated appropriate growth levels for their settlements as part of the neighbourhood planning process. In order to do this, neighbourhood plan groups have commissioned housing needs assessments (HNA) as part of their neighbourhood plan evidence base. These are considered at neighbourhood plan examinations to ensure that the ensuing policies meet ‘basic conditions’.

To inform what the level of housing need might be at Marnhull a number of calculations are set out below which use some of the same indicators as the HNA for Motcombe, the latest relevant neighbourhood plan that has been examined by an independent examiner and supported at the referendum stage.

1. Local Plan Part 1 housing requirement – ‘pro-rata’ approach

This is based on Marnhull’s percentage of the total second tier housing stock in North Dorset, multiplied by the rural area target (at least 825 dwellings / year). This two-step process is set out below:

Step 1: 2011 ‘pro rata’ estimate – using 2011 Census data

Dwellings in Marnhull [962] / Total dwellings in second tier settlements [9,044] = 10.6%

Step 2: apply the 'pro rata' estimate to the rural target

Rural target: 825 dwellings between 2011 and 2031, or 41.25 dwellings / year.

Rural target [41.25] X Pro-rata amount [10.6%] = at least **4.39 dwellings / year (avg)**.

- Over the 20 year plan period of LPP1 (2011-2031) this amounts to **88 dwellings**.

2. Emerging North Dorset Local target – pro-rata approach

The Government have published a formula known as the 'standard methodology' for calculating housing need. This will be used to inform preparation of future Local Plans. Using the data available at the time, the overall need figure quoted in the North Dorset Local Plan Review Issues and Options Consultation (November 2017) is 366 dwellings / year.

Step 3: apply a 'pro rata' uplift to the LP target to accommodate the latest Standard Methodology housing need figure

Proportionate uplift: $(366 - 285) / 285 = 28.4\%$

Okeford Fitzpaine target [4.39] X 1.284 = **5.63 dwellings / year (avg)**.

- Over the 20 year plan period of LPP1 (2011-2031) this amounts to **113 dwellings**.

3. Past Build Rates and Extant Permissions

Past build rates can give an impression of demand for housing, and what may be the baseline to judge whether the plan will 'boost' housing in line with national policy aims. However looking at past trends does not necessarily provide an indication of likely future need or demand. They are necessarily supply constrained as they relate to specific sites, whereas the assessment of housing need seeks to identify an unconstrained housing need figure.

Net completions between 1/4/2011 and 31/3/2020: 47 dwellings

Average annual completions: $47 / 9 = 5.22$ dwellings / year (avg).

Over the 20 year plan period of LPP1 (2011-2031) this amounts to **104 dwellings**

At 1st April 2020 there was consent for a further 36 dwellings in Marnhull that are considered to be in the 'deliverable' category. However, they may not all be implemented, so applying a 10% discount makes a reasonable allowance for this, and reduces the supply to 32 dwellings.

Since April, outline planning permission has been granted for 61 dwellings on Land North of Burton Street, Marnhull (ref 2/2018/1808/OUT, approved 16/9/2020). There is another outline application waiting to be determined for 58 dwellings on Land North of Chippel Lane (ref: 2/2018/0448/OUT)

4. Conclusions regarding appropriate increase in housing stock

- Using the same methodology used for a number of neighbourhood plans in the North Dorset district, the housing need in Marnhull is estimated to be between **88 to 113 dwellings** over the period 2011 to 2031.
- At 1st April 2020, 47 dwellings had already been completed.
- At 1st April 2020 there was extant consent for 36 dwellings in the deliverable category, making a reasonable prospect of a further 32 dwellings being developed (applying a 10% discount to the extant consents).
- This suggests we can be reasonably confident that the total growth in the village between 2011 and 2031 will be 79 dwellings.
- This falls 9 dwellings short of the estimated need for 88 dwellings, and 34 dwellings short of the estimated need for 113 dwellings during the plan period.
- Since 1st April 2020, an outline application for 61 dwellings has been approved at Marnhull. However, as we have no evidence that a developer is currently interested in the site, we are unable to argue that this site meets the NPPF definition of 'deliverable'. Suitable evidence in this respect might include a reserved matters application.

Overall conclusions

The proposed scheme is technically in the countryside and therefore contrary to policies in the adopted Local Plan. However, in the absence of a 5-year housing land supply, for this application NPPF deems the parts of the Local Plan policies relating to housing supply as 'out of date'. In line with the NPPF, permission should be granted unless the Framework "*provides a clear reason for refusing the development*" or "*any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the Framework taken as a whole.*"

There will of course be a full range of other matters to consider, including the impact on biodiversity, the historic environment, the landscape, and infrastructure capacity. However, in this case it is unlikely that cumulative impact on its own will be a sufficient constraining factor to justify refusal. Although 47 dwellings have been added to the village since 2011 and there is a deliverable supply of a further 36 dwellings with planning consent, this still falls short of the estimated needs figures outlined above. Although there are other schemes that either have outline consent or are seeking outline consent, we are not aware of evidence to suggest that they are 'deliverable' according to the NPPF definition. Until sites are deemed 'deliverable' they cannot contribute towards the 5-year housing land supply.

PR, 2/11/2020